Fort Hare, ALICE 8th Feb. 1933

Dear Mr Sepherd, I have gone through the MSS on the life of Mr Makiwane, and I wish to give you my impressions.

Its good points are these :-

/. The details are well linked to the history of the beginnings of Missionary work in our area, this being done in a fascinating and romantic style that will make the book attractive to read.

2. The tone and atmosphere are all that could be desired, the writer

keeping up a dignified manner.

3. The life is a valuable of ject lesson on the versatility of a clergyman, and will as such be a good addition to Xosa litera-

4. Maayi has made good side lights on the ideal Bantu teacher, as well as on other important members of Bantu sociaety.

5. He has lost no opportunity in impressing the reader with moral lessons at every point of this life

The one adverse criticism I wish to make is that Mqayi has imported into this life rather more than is necessary of the supposed enmity between Xosas and Fingoes, frequently expressing a surprise that Makiwane had been able to be above it, in making his second marriage with a Xosa woman, and I doubt if this feud did at all become as conspicuous as he makes out in page 135 during the Mzimba secession (i.e. that he remained loyal to the U.F.C. because of being influenced by his Kosa wife inasmuch as the secession was one of Fingoes seceding from a Xosa church).

In fact I fear he has been led away by extraneous reasons, because as a matter of history the modern Xosa-Fingo controversy began with the Fingo Holiday affair 1907 which provoked the Ntsikana affair, and ended about 1915 when I helped to hound it out of our politics. Now, Makiwane married his second wife long before this controversy, and Mzimba seceded long before it, 1889, 1898 respectively. I for one would not like this fine book marred by such provocative references, however indirectly. They are not essential to the proper understanding of Makiwane and his work, and might well be cut out if I had my way.

I would suggest that a typed duplicate of this story be circulated for criticism among the living Makiwane's and for additional touches to make the story more complete. For instance I am in a position to add five little details that would be helpful, while many more may occur to others who the hero more intimately. There seems no need to rush the publication of the book before its completeness is assured, for once it is out it will be one of our good books with a permanent interest, and worth adopting as a set book at Matriculation after the fault quoted above is eliminated.

Sincerely Yours,

Dolfabar